

# Digital Commons @ Georgia Law

Popular Media Faculty Scholarship

6-30-2010

# The Stupidest Lawyering Ever

Donald E. Wilkes Jr. *University of Georgia School of Law*, wilkes@uga.edu

#### Repository Citation

Wilkes, Donald E. Jr., "The Stupidest Lawyering Ever" (2010). Popular Media. Paper 68.  $http://digitalcommons.law.uga.edu/fac\_pm/68$ 

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Faculty Scholarship at Digital Commons @ Georgia Law. It has been accepted for inclusion in Popular Media by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ Georgia Law. For more information, please contact tstriepe@uga.edu.

# 

# TWO UNRELATED THINGS

#### The Best Website Ever?

Recently, former mayoral candidate Andy Rusk, in an online comment to this column, questioned the seriousness of Gwen O'Looney's mayoral candidacy because she did not have a website up. The answer to Andv's question can now be found at www.gwen2010.com on a site that features videos of Gwen discussing issues and is crammed with more extensive explanations of what Athens needs-written by Gwen herself.

Now, the rest of Pub Notes is turned over to UGA law school Professor Donald E. Wilkes, Jr., an expert in criminal procedure, capital punishment and post-conviction remedies.

Pete McCommons editor@flagpole.com

#### The Stupidest Lawyering Ever

Last Wednesday and Thursday, June 23 and 24, Georgia death row inmate Troy Davis finally got what he has been seek ing for over a decade—a court hearing allowing him to present newly discovered evidence he is innocent of the murder of off-duty policeman Mark MacPhail. That hearing was a disaster, however, because of the cataclysmic blundering of his own attorneys. As he sat in the federal district courtroom in iail garb and leg irons watching events unfold, Davis must surely have come to the sickening realization that his lawyers were quilty of some of the stupidest lawvering on record.

Davis' newly discovered evidence, consisting of witnesses and affidavits, points to one Sylvester Coles as the person actually guilty of the murder. Yet Davis' attorneys failed to subpoena Coles, and Coles never appeared at the hearing. Putting Coles on the stand would have been a win-win situation for Davis: if Coles admitted being the murderer, Davis would be cleared; if Coles pled the Fifth Amendment, this would reflect unfavorably on Coles and permit numerous inferences in favor of Davis' innocence; and if Coles denied everything, he would still be subjected to rigorous questioning that might trip him up or damage his credibility. Furthermore, failing to put him on the stand would reflect badly on Davis' innocence claims. Why wouldn't an innocent convict seize the opportunity to put the real killer on the stand and grill him?

Only attorneys whose guiding policy is stupidity would fail to subpoena Coles in advance of the hearing, but Davis' lawyers did. The harm this caused to Davis was apparent at the hearing. At the end of Wednesday's hearing, according to the AP reporter who was present, the presiding judge, William Moore, "said he's highly skeptical of testimony that another man had admitted to shooting MacPhail because Davis' attorneys did not subpoena the man they say is the real killer."

As for the Thursday hearing, AP reports: "Davis' lawyers did not call Coles to the stand, and Moore made them pay for it. He ruled out testimony by a number of witnesses who would have said Coles told them he killed MacPhail, on the grounds it was inadmissible hearsay. Moore told Davis' lawyers they could have gotten around that by calling Coles to the stand and giving him a chance to rebut that testimony, 'Here's one of the most critical witnesses to Davis' defense, Moore said. 'Mr. Coles is available to testify and you don't call him. Mr. Coles should have been called by you! [0]ne of Davis' lawyers said the legal team tried unsuccessfully to serve Coles with a subpoena Wednesday, soon after Moore said he might not give any weight to hearsay evidence. Too late, Moore shot back, noting the hearing had been set months in advance."

It is impossible to predict what ruling the judge will hand down when he decides the case, but because of the gross incompetence of his attorneys it seems doubtful that Davis will be found to have satisfied his heavy burden of clearly establishing his innocence. If the judge concludes that there has been no demonstration of innocence, it is almost certain that sooner or later Davis will be put to death. This means that if Davis is innocent-and most unbiased persons familiar with the evidence believe he is-his execution would be due in large part to the startling stupidness of his own attorneys, whose ineptness prevented production in court of the evidence establishing his innocence. An innocent man might die on account of the stupidity of his own lawyers: lethal, fatal, unpardonable stupidity.

Donald E. Wilkes, Jr.

## THIS WEEK'S ISSUE: **NEWS & FEATURES**

Athens News and Views
Adangerous intersection is due for a makeover, and Paul Broun, Jr. is due a nice payoff from Big Oil. 35 Days in the Gulf of Mexico, Pt. 2 . . . . . 8 Tough Duty on a Deep Water Oil Rig A second and final tour on a sister ship to the Deep

#### **ARTS & EVENTS**

A graphic novel depicts the struggle between an eco-warrior and the forces of corporate darkness. Strange Times
ATHICA Emerges: "Uncertainty" seeks to encapsulate our increasingly uncertain times.

#### MUSIC

Flagpole Athens Music Awards Recap . . . . 14 A Night Fit for a King... and Carnies
This year's winners plus a recap of the weirdness and wonder of the evening

God Bless American Music . . . . . . . . . . . . 18 The 4th of July American Music Festival Returns for Its Second Year

LETTERS4	MOVIE PICK
CITY DOPE	AWARDS SHOW RECAP
ATHENS RISING5	THREATS & PROMISES 15
CITY PAGES6	HOT NEW MEXICANS
CAPITOL IMPACT7	AMERICAN MUSIC FESTIVAL 18
35 DAYS IN THE GULF, PT. 2 8	THE CALENDAR!
THE READER9	BULLETIN BOARD24
CAVEMEN IN SPACE10	ART AROUND TOWN 25
ART NOTES11	COMICS
FILM NOTEBOOK11	REALITY CHECK
MOVIE DOPE	CLASSIFIEDS

#### THIS WEEK AT FLAGPOLE.COM

- >> World View looks at the McCrystal firing
- Cobbloviate tries to look at soccer

"Red. White & Brewgrass" Festival expands and gets a new name.

- > Ort explains lawnmower beer
- > AthFest live reviews and photo gallery
- > The best of Bonnaroo recap
- >> Local music podcasts, live reviews and tweets at twitter.com/FlagpoleMusic
- >> Talk back! We want to hear from you. Send a Letter to the Editor
- >> Get your event listed! Our online Calendar form makes it easy

EDITOR & PUBLISHER Pete McCommons ADVERTISING DIRECTOR & PUBLISHER Alicia Nickies PRODUCTION DIRECTOR Larry Tenner

na Cotte

ADVERTISING SALES Anita Autom, VA India Edwards, Jessica Pritchard MUSIC EDITOR Michael Grandat

CITY EDITOR Dave Marr CLASSIFIEDS, DISTRIBUTION & OFFICE MANAGER Paul Karisan

CLASSIFIEDS, DISTRIBUTION & OFFICE MANAGER Pauf Karjian
AD EXIGENEES des Richext, Rolly Robusto
CARTOONISTS James Allen, Cameron Bogue, Ryan Hall, Jacob Hoot, Missy Kolik, Jereny Long, Devid Mack
ABRET ME Special Report Cinds, Bern
Develope Lands, Contraction Contract Cont

A ATION Charles Granifed, Harper Bridgers, Jessey Courses, Swee Francke, Matt Shi

WEB DESIGNER Ion Richert ADVENTISING ASSISTANT Maggie Summers IDITORIAL ASSISTANT Erro Cork

NE INTERNS Laura Client Milyting

free at over 275 Vocations around Athers, Georgia: Subscriptions cost \$55 a year. ISSUE NUMBER 26 Distar in months & 2010 Plaquels, Inc. 80 rights research.

DOM: ASSESSED



**COVER DESIGN** by Kelly Ruberto featuring a painting by Deb by on display at the Lyndon House





## CONTACT US:

STREET ADDRESS: 112 S. Foundry St., Athens. GA 30601 MAILING ADDRESS: P.O. Box 1027, Athens, GA 30603 EDITORIAL: (706) 549-9523 ADVERTISING: (706) 549-0301 FAX: (706) 548-8981

> ADVERTISING: ads@flagpole.com CALENDAR: calendar@flagpole.com COMICS: comics@flagpole.com EDITORIAL: editor Offlagpole.com LETTERS: letters@ftagpole.com MUSIC, music@flagpole.com NEWS: reworldingsolv.com WEB SITE: web@flagpole.com





