11-1-2011

Fiscal Federalism in the United States

Walter Hellerstein
Which Model of “Fiscal Federalism”?  

FISCAL FEDERALISM  
IN THE  
UNITED STATES  

Walter Hellerstein  
Francis Shackelford Professor of Taxation  
Distinguished Research Professor  
University of Georgia Law School  

Torino  
5 November 2011
US Fiscal Federalism

Introduction and Overview

- Lack of a discrete body of foundational rules
  - “A page of history is worth a volume of logic”
- Fiscal constitution
- Distribution of taxing powers
- Control and coordination of taxing powers
- Effective exercise of taxing powers
The Fiscal Constitution

- Federal Fiscal Powers
  - Federal taxing power
  - Federal spending power
  - Other federal fiscal powers
- State Fiscal Powers
  - State taxing power
  - State spending power
- Intergovernmental Tax Immunities
The Fiscal Constitution

- Federal Taxing Power
  - “Power to lay and collect Taxes, Duties, Imposts and Excises”

- Limitations
  - Revenue bills must originate in House
  - No taxation of exports
  - No “direct” tax without apportionment
    - 16th Amendment
  - Due process limits on retroactive legislation
The Fiscal Constitution

- Federal Spending Power
  - “Power to lay and collect Taxes, Duties, Imposts and Excises … to pay the Debts and provide for the common Defense and General Welfare of the United States”

- Limitations *(South Dakota v. Dole (1987))*
  - Pursuit of general welfare
  - Conditional grants to states must be explicit
  - Relation to federal interest
  - Cannot violate other constitutional provisions
The Fiscal Constitution

- Other Federal Fiscal Powers
  - Power to borrow
  - Power to coin money and regulate value
The Fiscal Constitution

State Fiscal Powers: Overview

- States retain all “sovereign” powers not delegated to federal government
- Taxing and spending powers are essential attributes of state “sovereignty”
The Fiscal Constitution

- State Taxing Power: Limitations
  - No taxation of imports or exports
  - No “duty of tonnage”
  - “Horizontal” federalism restraints
    - Compact Clause – no compacts enhancing state vis-à-vis federal power
    - “Negative” Commerce Clause – no burdens on interstate commerce
    - Due process clause – territorial restraints
    - Equal protection clause – classification restraints
The Fiscal Constitution

- Intergovernmental Tax Immunities
  - Historical development of doctrine
  - State taxation of the federal government and its instrumentalities
  - Federal taxation of state government and its instrumentalities
Distribution of Taxing Powers

- Property Taxes

  - Effective “tax assignment” to states
    - “No … direct tax shall be paid, unless in proportion to the Census.”
    - “Direct taxes shall be apportioned among the several states”
  - Historical precedent: federal property taxes (1813, 1815, 1861)
Distribution of Taxing Powers

- Concurrent Taxing Powers
  - Income Taxes
  - Consumption and Other Excise Taxes
    - Prohibition on federal taxation of exports
    - Prohibition on state taxation of imports and exports
  - Wealth Transfer Taxes
Control and Coordination of Taxing Powers

- Congress’s Plenary Power to Control and Coordinate Taxing Powers
- Property Taxes
- Income Taxes
  - Federal-State Base Conformity
  - Tax “Concessions”
    - Deductibility of State and Local Taxes from Federal Base
    - Exclusion of State and Local Government Bond Interest
- Other Congressional Legislation Addressing State Power to Tax Income
Control and Coordination of Taxing Powers

- Consumption and Other Excise Taxes
  - Federal legislation addressed to state taxation

- Wealth Transfer Taxes
  - Federal estate tax of 1916 and state death tax credit
  - Repeal of federal estate tax and the end of federal-state death tax comity
Effective Exercise of Taxing Powers

- Federal, State, Local Tax Revenues (FY 2009)
  - Total: $3,307,842M ($3.3 trillion)
  - Federal: $2,052,872M ($2 trillion) (62%)
  - State and Local: $1,254,970M ($1.25 trillion) (38%)
    - State: $691,613M ($692 billion) (21%)
    - Local: $563,357M (563 billion) (17%)
Effective Exercise of Taxing Powers

Federal Tax Revenues (FY 2009)

- Individual income $915M  44.6%
- Corporate income $138M  6.7%
- Payroll* $891M  43.4%
- Excise $62M  3.0%
- Estate/gift $23M  1.1%
- Customs duties $22M  1.1%

*Social Security
Effective Exercise of Taxing Powers

State and Local Tax Revenues (FY 2009)

- Individual income $252M 20.1%
- Corporate income $48M 3.8%
- Property $458M 36.5%
- General sales $285M 22.7%
- Selective excise* $83M 6.6%
- Other $128M 10.2%

*Motor fuel, tobacco, alcohol, etc.
Effective Exercise of Taxing Powers

State Tax Revenues (FY 2009)

- Individual income $235M 34.0%
- Corporate income $41M 5.9%
- Property $13M 1.9%
- General sales $224M 32.4%
- Selective excise* $80M 11.6%
- Other $99M 14.3%

*Motor fuel, tobacco, alcohol, etc.
Effective Exercise of Taxing Powers

Local Tax Revenues (FY 2009)

- Individual income $17M 3.0%
- Corporate income $6M 1.2%
- Property $445M 79.1%
- General sales $62M 11.0%
- Selective excise* $3M 0.7%
- Other $30M 5.2%

*Motor fuel, tobacco, alcohol, etc.
Effective Exercise of Taxing Powers

- Functional Allocation of Taxing Powers
  - Income – concurrent
  - Consumption – state
  - Property – local
  - Wealth transfer – historical footnote

- “American Exceptionalism”
  - 95% of national revenues from income
  - No national consumption tax
Conclusion

- “A page of history is worth a volume of logic.”
- Pragmatic work in progress or ???